

Space Lusitania: India and Pakistan

Move 1 India Team Briefing

June 12, 2023

What is your team's preferred end state for this crisis?

- Our desired end-state is that strategic deterrence is re-established and to that end no further attacks are acceptable.
- Ensure Indian space assets are available throughout the crisis and in a potential conflict.
- Create an indigenous satellite constellation capability that is not vulnerable to a single attack
- Develop a drone defense system – if we had nuclear-capable aircrafts attacked this easily by drones, we should be putting resources to attack them.
- We should be able to detect the drones coming into our airspace.
- Develop a closer working relationship with the U.S. involving the exchange of military/intel resources and capabilities and cementing them legally, not just rhetorically. This relationship must be much more grounded in legality.

What information does your team need from other teams? What information can your team provide to other teams?

- From the U.S.:
 - What is your response to the Chinese co-orbital systems launched into similar orbits of the U.S.-owned Maxar constellation?
 - Based on the CIA briefing, we would appreciate the United States making a public statement that corroborates the intel you have passed to India indicating that Pakistan is responsible for these attacks.
 - The U.S. should make a non-public communication to China warning them to keep the 3 co-orbital satellites very far from the Maxar satellites. Please BCC us on this communication.
 - Is there any update to your HUMINT that stated the Pakistani proxy groups were responsible for launching those attacks?
 - Could you provide us any indications and warnings that you may have about further drone sorties? Then we could action aircraft that may be on alert to go intercept.
 - Does your SSA provide indications of satellite downlink to the drones or does it only provide location of satellites in constellations?

What information does your team need from other teams? What information can your team provide to other teams? (continued)

- Is there another source that we could ask about the source of the drone attacks?
 - Could we ask any other Quad partners?
 - Other commercial satellite companies?
- We asked China:
 - In light of attacks on India's nuclear capability, sovereignty, and territorial integrity, and China's failure to act, we demand that China stop providing all space services to all Pakistani entities.
- We asked Control:
 - What anti-drone capabilities do we have around the Ambala base?
 - What types/sizes of drones were used in the attack on Ambala?
- We asked Pakistan:
 - India demands that you hand over the terrorists or India will take action.
 - Have you made any inroads in identifying the terrorists that made this attack so that we can bring them to justice? Have you made any efforts to secure the data that you are receiving from the Chinese space assets to ensure it is not falling into the hands of wrongful actors?
- We would share the images from Planet

What actions does your team need to take?

- Determine where the drone attacks came from within Pakistan:
 - Is there another source that we could ask about the source of the drone attacks?
 - Could we ask any other Quad partners?
 - Other commercial satellite companies, e.g. Planet?
 - Is it possible to get our own Indian HUMINT intelligence?
- Deploy electronic attack capability – e.g., jamming – that could disrupt the over-the-horizon command capability of the drones, that would be effective and not escalate the situation (India has no dedicated drone defense units).
- Disperse the rest of the nuclear-capable aircraft from the Ambala airbase to ensure we maintain our nuclear capability while we are trying to pursue dialog
- What kind of response are we getting from the UN Security Council?
 - We need to use our membership to ensure the world knows that this is an attack on India – on our airbase, on our command structure. We want to be sure there is not a more escalatory attack coming.
- We reserve the right to determine a place and time of our choosing and in the domain of our choosing for our response.
- We have evidence from the drones we have retrieved and accessed the pre-loaded flight paths. We are analyzing the data and will share the who, how and where with the international bodies and the other players.
- Indian cities are breaking out in protest over the killing of the Indian airmen and the India media is going crazy. Should we send a demarche to the Pakistani embassy asking what they are doing to prevent these attacks?
- Not just the response to the attacks, but the PR response.
- Ask China to cease providing access to these satellite services to Pakistan

What legal arguments can India make that China's "support" of the attack was an act of war; on what basis could China claim the same of India's dazzling of its satellite? Are there other legal contentions any of the teams need to anticipate or be prepared to make?

- There have been 2 escalatory attacks, China is not simply passively enabling, but actively collaborating; plus they sent three co-orbital spacecraft. This is more than a coincidence.
- Pakistan has enabled its sovereign territory to be utilized by terrorist groups to build weapons systems to attack India, which resulted in the destruction of Indian fighter planes, airborne warning system and the death of 29 service personnel. So Pakistan, in India's perception, should have legal liability for these attacks.
- China is in breach of Article III of the OST, which states must conduct activities in accordance with international peace and security in accordance with international law
- Art VI: states bear international responsibility for national activities in outer space including government and non-government entities and ensuring conformity with the OST
- Article IX of the OST: You must be mindful of due regard for other nations activities. If you start sending satellites into low-Earth orbit and dealing with debris you may escalate the crisis.
 - We are reading this as China is saying they may do something similar to the Maxar satellites and the Indian company that is doing this together. We are reading this as signaling of strategic intent.
- In addition, India, as a member of the UN Security Council, is bringing a resolution to condemn the attack on Indian sovereignty and is moving to pass a resolution to constitute this as a threat to international peace and security.